

OPINION 1821

Cliola (Hybopsis) topeka Gilbert, 1884 (currently *Notropis topeka*; Osteichthyes, Cypriniformes): specific name conserved

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; Osteichthyes; Cypriniformes; freshwater fish; *Notropis topeka*; North America.

Ruling

(1) Under the plenary powers the specific name *tristis* Girard, 1856, as published in the binomen *Moniana tristis*, is hereby suppressed for the purposes of the Principle of Priority but not for those of the Principle of Homonymy.

(2) The name *topeka* Gilbert, 1884, as published in the binomen *Cliola (Hybopsis) topeka*, is hereby placed on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology.

(3) The name *tristis* Girard, 1856, as published in the binomen *Moniana tristis* and as defined by the lectotype (specimen no. MNHN 427 in the Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, Paris) designated by Mayden & Gilbert (1989), suppressed in (1) above, is hereby placed on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology.

History of Case 2808

An application for the conservation of the specific name of *Cliola (Hybopsis) topeka* Gilbert, 1884 was received from Drs Frank B. Cross and Joseph T. Collins (*Museum of Natural History, The University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kansas, U.S.A.*) on 11 January 1991. After correspondence the case was published in BZN 49: 268–270 (December 1992). Notice of the case was sent to appropriate journals.

A comment in support from Prof Hobart M. Smith (*University of Colorado, Colorado, U.S.A.*) was published in BZN 50: 144 (June 1993). Opposing comments from Prof Richard L. Mayden (*University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, Alabama, U.S.A.*) & Dr Carter R. Gilbert (*Florida Museum of Natural History, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida, U.S.A.*), and from Dr Bernard Kuhajda (*University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, Alabama, U.S.A.*), were published in BZN 50: 287–289 (December 1993). A reply by the authors of the application was published at the same time (BZN 50: 289). A further comment from Prof Mayden was published in BZN 51: 262 (September 1994). A comment from Dr Reeve M. Bailey (*Museum of Zoology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, U.S.A.*), published in BZN 51: 262–263, supported the application and also pointed out that Girard's paper, in which the name *Moniana tristis* appeared, was first published in 1856 (and not 1857 as cited in the application).

Decision of the Commission

On 1 March 1995 the members of the Commission were invited to vote on the proposals published in BZN 49: 269. At the close of the voting period on 1 June 1995 the votes were as follows:

Affirmative votes — 17: Bock, Cocks, Corliss, Hahn, Heppell, Holthuis, Kraus, Mahnert, Martins de Souza, Minelli, Nielsen, Nye, Ride, Savage, Schuster, Starobogatov, Štys

Negative votes — 6: Bouchet, Dupuis, Kabata, Lehtinen, Macpherson and Thompson.

No votes were received from Cogger, Halvorsen, Trjapitzin and Uéno.

Bayer was on leave of absence.

Voting for, Bock commented: 'It is essential for all zoologists to realize that the only goal of zoological nomenclature is to facilitate communication between all workers interested in the biology of animals. Nothing is gained and much is lost every time an established name is replaced by an unused senior synonym regardless of why the senior synonym had become unused. Hence I urge all zoologists to apply to the Commission every time they discover such an unused senior synonym rather than to introduce this name into the zoological literature. Every effort should be made to conserve well-established names and to suppress unused senior synonyms'. Cocks commented: 'This is clearly a case of the 'rules' versus 'established usage'. I was swayed in the end by Dr Bailey's support'. Voting against, Dupuis commented: 'Owing to some taxonomic uncertainties and doubts concerning the syntypes and lectotypes of the two nominal species in question, I vote against. This is not a vote in favour of the inscription of *tristis* Girard, 1856 on the Official List, which would be premature'. Thompson commented: 'The arguments of Mayden & C.R. Gilbert should be heeded. The application requests that a junior name be conserved on the basis of 'usage'. 'Usage' is difficult to define; it is not merely the number of authors and titles. Adoption of the senior name *tristis* Girard in a Peterson field guide undoubtedly accounts for more than all the scientific papers cited by Cross & Collins. When there are reasonable arguments on both sides the final arbiter is priority, not usage'.

Original references

The following are the original references to the names placed on an Official List and an Official Index by the ruling given in the present Opinion:

tristis, *Moniana*, Girard, 1856. *Researches upon the cyprinoid fishes inhabiting the fresh waters of the United States, west of the Mississippi Valley, from specimens in the museum of the Smithsonian Institution*, p. 37. (First issued as a separate in September 1856; published in the *Proceedings of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia*, 8: 201 in 1857).

topeka, *Cliola* (*Hybopsis*), Gilbert, 1884. *Bulletin of the Washburn College Laboratory of Natural History*, 1(1): 13.

The following is the reference for the designation of the lectotype of *Moniana tristis* Girard, 1856:

Mayden, R.L. & Gilbert, C.R. 1989. *Copeia*, 1989(4): 1087.